Committee Minutes

Meeting Corporate and Scrutiny Management Policy

and Scrutiny Committee

Date 14 September 2015

Present Councillors Levene (Chair), Fenton, Flinders,

Gates, Kramm, Lisle, Williams, Cuthbertson (sub for Cllr Reid) and Rawlings (sub for Cllr

Galvin)

Apologies Councillors Galvin and Reid

19. Declarations of Interest

At this point in the meeting, Members were asked to declare any personal interests not included on the register of interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interest which they might have in respect of the business on the agenda.

Councillor Flinders declared a disclosable pecuniary interest in relation to agenda item 4 – 2014/15 Outturn report as his employer advised the authority in relation to the York Central site and he took no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

Councillor Fenton declared a personal non prejudicial interest in relation to agenda item 8 – Petitions: Pedestrian Crossing Askham Lane/Westfield School as he lived in the vicinity of the site.

20. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the last meeting of the

Committee, held on 13 July 2015, be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record subject to the amendment of Minute 13 – Consultation on Decision Making Arrangements. In the second bullet point the deletion of the first word 'General..' and its

replacement with the word 'Some..'

21. Public Participation

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

22. 2014/15 Outturn

Members considered a report which analysed the outturn for 2014/15 for the services falling under the responsibility of the Corporate & Scrutiny Management Policy & Scrutiny Committee.

It was noted that the net budget for the areas covered by these services was £19,414k, with the outturn showing an under spend of £211k, with the main areas of under spend being vacant posts.

Concerns were expressed regarding some aspects of the new speech server telephony software, details of which would be passed on to Officers.

Resolved: That the information report be received and noted.

Reason: To update the Committee on the outturn for 2014/15.

23. 2015/16 Monitor 1

Consideration was given to a report which forecast the 2015/16 outturn position for the services falling with the responsibility of the Corporate & Scrutiny Management Policy & Scrutiny Committee.

It was noted that the net budget for the areas covered by these services was £16,121k with a small under spend of £160k forecast.

Members requested comparison information e.g. for Council and Business Tax collection rates, wifi on public transport usage etc to help inform them of performance against other authorities. It was confirmed that this request would be passed on to the Officers concerned.

Resolved: That the information report be received and noted.

Reason: To update the Committee on the forecast position for

2015/16.

24. Future Ways of Working in Scrutiny

Consideration was given to a report which updated the Committee on proposals for new decision making arrangements which allowed for the consultation of scrutiny prior to a decision being made. The Executive had now invited the Committee to consider how best to involve Scrutiny Committees in predecision call-in's, the possible establishment of a sub-committee to deal with urgent pre-decision call-in's and the remits of Scrutiny Committees.

Some Members expressed the view that the new scrutiny committee remits would be better aligned with the new Executive Member portfolio areas, took account of the new organisation review, partners and promotion of the city's health and wellbeing. The Committee also confirmed that Members of the relevant scrutiny committees would be welcome, as non voting Members, to attend future pre decision Calling-In meetings for their expertise and knowledge. Members also supported the publication of a weekly Forward Plan and agreed it should provide sufficient information to enable Members to decide whether or not a pre-decision call-in was required.

Following further discussion it was

Resolved: (i) That the detail of the new pre-decision scrutiny arrangements be received and noted.

- (ii) That the Chair and Vice Chair be requested to work with the Scrutiny Officers to bring forward recommendations to a future meeting on suggested remits for the standing Scrutiny Committees, bearing in mind Member comments above.
- (iii) That a standing invitation be sent to Chairs and/or Vice Chairs of the standing Scrutiny Committees, to attend future CSMPSC meetings as non-voting Members to

speak/participate on items within their portfolio areas. 1.

- (iv) That arrangements be made for all Members to receive an alert to inform them of the weekly publication of the Forward Plan.
- (v) That an item be included in the Committees work plan for their 11 January 2016 meeting for a review of the new ways of working, to include details of any financial implications. ²

Reason:

To implement revised decision making arrangements involving scrutiny and to refresh scrutiny activity.

JP

Action Required

1. Extend a standing invitation to Chairs and/or Vice Chairs of scrutiny committees to attend future CSMPSC meetings.

2. Include item on Committees work plan. JP

25. Guildhall Development Review Introductory Report

Consideration was given to an overview report of the background information on the proposals, as developed to date, for the future use of the Guildhall complex, including a summary of the key points, events and milestones. It was noted that a further meeting of the Committee would take place on Wednesday 16 September with external consultees to enable Members to feed into the Executive report on the possible commercially viable uses for the complex.

The Guildhall Project Manager reminded the Committee that the project had been put on hold pending preparation of a robust business case and examination of other commercially viable uses for the Guildhall complex. He confirmed that a further report on the four proposed options for the future use of the Guildhall together with an analysis of potential viability, including details of Gross Value Added (GVA) in respect of each would be provided at the Committee's next meeting on 16 September and that the Committee's comments would be taken into consideration by the Executive at their October meeting.

The Project Manager also updated Members that the application to the Heritage Lottery Fund, submitted in May 2015, for additional project funding had been unsuccessful. However an in principle offer of £1m had been received from the Leeds City Region LEP towards the delivery of a Digital Media Arts Centre.

Members expressed concern that the additional analysis information would not be circulated prior to the next meeting and referred to consideration of a possible additional option of relocating Democratic and Civic Services to the Guildhall to provide additional space at West Offices for the use of partners.

Following further discussion it was

- Resolved: (i) That the background and introductory information provided in the report and at Annex A be received and noted.
 - (ii) That the information on the four proposed options for the future use of the Guildhall, together with the analysis of the potential viability of each be circulated to Members prior to the 16 September meeting, to allow consideration prior to the meeting.

Reason: To ensure cross party feedback into the Executive's consideration of the future development of the Guildhall complex.

26. Schedule of Petitions

Consideration was given to a list of seven current petitions, received by the Council, details of which were set out at Annex A of the report. It was noted that agreement to review the list of petitions in a reduced format had previously been made by the Committee in order to make the information more relevant and manageable.

A briefing note in respect of two e-petitions relating to the Parliament Street Fountain was circulated and considered at the meeting (attached to the online agenda). It was noted that the petitions had been raised in response to a request received by the Council from Make it York to remove the Parliament Street fountain.

Members also considered the information provided in relation to the status of the petitions that had been considered by the relevant Executive Member and the additional briefing note and it was

Resolved: (i) That the action taken in relation to petitions 20, 22, 25, 26 and 27 be noted.

- (ii) That the update provided in relation to petitions 28, 30, 31 and 32 be received and noted.
- (iii) That petition 29 relating to the Parliament Street Fountain and the additional 550 signatory fountain e-petition, reported at the meeting, be referred to the Learning & Culture Policy & Scrutiny Committee for their consideration, and feedback to the relevant Executive Member /Executive.

Reason: To ensure the Committee carries out its new requirements in relation to petitions.

27. Work Plan 2015/16

Consideration was given to the Committee's work plan for the 2015/16 municipal year.

Members referred to the possible contribution of scrutiny into the current devolution bids. Officers confirmed that the bids were for regional negotiation and that Members would be kept updated outside of the meeting.

Resolved: That the Committee's work plan for 2015/16 be received and noted, subject to the following addition:

11 January 2016

Future Ways of Working in Scrutiny – update/review and financial implications

Reason: To inform Members of the Committee's work during the current year municipal year

Councillor D Levene, Chair [The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 6.55 pm].